

Susan Burgstrom

From: John Hall
Sent: Tuesday, March 29, 2022 8:04 AM
To: Susan Burgstrom
Subject: Wind Turbine Relocation Plan recommends 2923' (7.4 x tip height) for 397' Falmouth, Massachusetts turbines

From: Ted Hartke <tedhartke@hartke.pro>
Sent: Monday, March 28, 2022 11:56 PM
To: John Hall <jhall@co.champaign.il.us>
Subject: Wind Turbine Relocation Plan recommends 2923' (7.4 x tip height) for 397' Falmouth, Massachusetts turbines

Dear John,

At all of the wind turbine meetings I have presented, I regularly promote 39 dBA maximum noise limits because 40 dBA begins adverse health effects (sleep impacts.)

These are some details which came out of the Falmouth Massachusetts city-owned wind turbine issues. A court-ordered shutdown and removal of the turbines has occurred after a very similar situation to my house in Vermilion County Illinois took place. I think there were 7 homes affected by the two turbines.

Besides Apex purchasing homes or getting good neighbor agreement waivers at 2640 feet, is there any evidence or science that calls for less than this 2923 feet?

In Falmouth Massachusetts, the courts ordered both of the city-owned wind turbines to be torn down. The city is trying to relocate them to another place where they will be OK. An acoustician was hired (company by the name of Weston and Sampson) to show them where the turbine would be safe due to noise issues turbines cause. **His analysis landed at 2923 feet for these 1.65 mW turbines being 397 feet to the blade tip. This distance is 7.4 x tip height and 10.9 x rotor diameter. The noise at 2923 feet will be 40 dBA, which is the noise level where adverse health effects begin and also the maximum noise level from the court proceedings. (The town was trying to place the turbines at setbacks of 2147 and 2244 feet, but the noise level at that distance was expected to be 43 dBA.)**

Dr. Schomer did a test for Livingston County Illinois 500' tall turbines and concluded that 3250 feet protected most residences from excessive noise. (6.5 x tip height) The predicted noise level at my home in Vermilion County Illinois was 43 dBA. The actual noise level measured at my house during the 2013 noise study was approximately 46 dBA. The turbines at my abandoned Vermilion County home were 1665' and 2225' away. ($2225/495 = 4.5x$ tip height proven to be too close.)

Here's a link for more detailed information:

<https://patch.com/massachusetts/falmouth/acoustic-expert-falmouth-wind-turbine-ii-needs-2923-setback?fbclid=IwAR1cAKpn7iEbWKxegGldCS9QdDVp3LhLTWPyaUUHcbOG6VELG8v7MdxNUhM>

Robert W. Rand, ASA, INCE
RAND ACOUSTICS, LLC
65 Mere Point Road
Brunswick, ME 04011

RECEIVED

MAR 29 2022

CHAMPAIGN CO. P & Z DEPARTMENT

rrand@randacoustics.com

TEL: 207.632.1215

FAX: 206.339.3441

October 26, 2018

Mr. Julian M. Suso, Town Manager

Mr. Rod Palmer, Building Commissioner

Town of Falmouth

59 Town Hall Square

Falmouth, MA 02540

Re: Wind Turbine Relocation Study

Weston & Sampson Report October 12, 2018

Mr. Suso, Mr. Palmer,

This letter is respectfully submitted to the Town of Falmouth to provide a qualified professional opinion about the proposed relocation of Wind II. The original permittings for Wind I and Wind II (and NOTUS) resulted in neighbor complaints soon after start-up and were confirmed to exceed Falmouth's 40-dBA noise limit (turbines sited too close). Weston & Sampson's relocation recommendation for Wind II appears to be inconsistent with the Town 40 dBA noise limit and the 2017 Barnstable Superior Court Decision.

1. The distance to meet 40 dBA for Wind II, a Vestas V82 with sound power level of 110 dBA, is approximately 891 meters or 2923 feet. This is greater than the setback distances provided by the proposed new location. The proposed new location is still too close.

2. At 2147 and 2244 feet listed in the subject report, the expected sound level is 43 dBA.

3. Use of the proposed new location appears certain to result in the relocated wind turbine's maximum noise levels exceeding the Falmouth noise limit of 40 dBA.

4. Use of the proposed new location appears certain to result in the relocated wind turbine's maximum noise levels exceeding established background sound levels of 27-28 dBA by over 10 dB, breaching State 10-dB noise limits. Supporting detail is provided below. Please contact me if you have any questions.

5. My work in professional acoustical consulting spans thirty-eight years with project experience in power generation, industrial and commercial noise and expert witness status established in hearings, testimony, and legal cases for aircraft and wind turbine noise. Peerreviewed publications include papers for a 2011 noise survey of the NOTUS wind turbine.

6. Falmouth noise limit: 40 dBA, Article XXXIV, "Windmills" in Chapter 240, Zoning, in the Town of Falmouth bylaws, clarified in [1] that noise levels over 40 dBA "shall be excessive".

7. The subject report states "The location of AL-1 is approximately 2,147 feet from the nearest residential receptor to the north and approximately 2,244 feet from the nearest residential areas located south along Blacksmith Shop Road." [AL-1 is the proposed new location].

8. Wind II is a Vestas V82 1.65MW wind turbine with a maximum sound power level of 110 dBA re 1pW. Approximately 2625 feet is needed for 40 dBA for a sound power level of 108 dBA [1]. Greater distance is needed for a sound power level of 110 dBA.

9. The subject report's "Section 3.1 Sound Impacts" fails to properly assess the noise level increase above existing quiet background levels established by HMMH at 27-28 dBA [2].

10. State law 310 CMR 7.10 limits noise increase to 10 dB (Lmax) over the background level (L90). The maximum level allowed for Wind II is therefore 38 dBA at property lines. Quiet background occurs with wind shear; strong winds aloft, light to no winds near ground.

11. Regardless of wind-shear effects on lowering or raising the background sound level, the Falmouth noise limit of 40 dBA sets an upper limit for wind turbine noise at property lines.

12. Computations may be made to determine sound level at distance and distance associated to a sound level. ISO 9613-2 relates received noise level to sound power level and distance.

$L_p = L_w - 20 \log(\text{distance, meters}) - 11, \text{ dB, and by equivalence,}$

$\text{Distance} = 10^{(L_w - L_p - 11)/20}, \text{ meters, where}$

L_w is sound power level, dBA re 1pW,

L_p is received sound level, dBA re 20uPA, and

1 meter = 3.28 feet.

Ground absorption and atmospheric absorption factors are not included since winter-frozen conditions present hard ground and wind turbine noise is elevated and predominantly low frequency. Noise measurements of Wind I and NOTUS wind turbines during non-winter conditions have confirmed these factors may be excluded for estimating wind turbine sound level versus distance and this computation method is accurate within 1-2 dB. The general computation uncertainty is +/- 3 dB within 1000 meters (3280 feet).

1. Memorandum of Decision, Superior Court Civil Action 2014-00003, filed June 20, 2017.

2. Technical Memorandum to DEP from HMMH, Addendum to HMMH Report 304390, April 1, 2011.

Special message: **My email was hacked Dec 30, 2016.** If you received a message that looks like it came from me and it asks you to click a link to share files, DO NOT CLICK ON LINKS OR ICONS. I will never send you a link or ask you to download anything unless I include a detailed project-specific correspondence. To protect yourself, never attempt to download files or click links which seem random or out of the ordinary.

Theodore P. Hartke, PE, PLS

President

Hartke Engineering and Surveying, Inc.

117 S. East Avenue P.O. Box 123

Ogden, Illinois 61859 217.840.1612

tedhartke@hartke.pro